THE SOCIETY DEBATE

Hours before the wrangling of society members officially commenced in Disputation X, four Peucinians formally debated the resolution in the Shannon Room of Hubbard Hall for an independent study in Constitutional Law with Professor Richard Morgan. Archibald Abrams ’09 and Christine Carletta ’10 each affirmed that federalism has outlived its usefulness to America while Steven Bartus ’08 and Ross Jacobs ’10 each advocated for federalism’s retention.

After a short hiatus for dinner, the four debaters reconvened in the Peucinian room to open the debate to the Society. Members engaged the subject in new and intriguing ways, but the essential arguments of the four remained prevalent throughout discussion.

❖ Steve to Christine: State innovation and competition meet the needs of local citizens
❖ Christine to Steve: In particularly large areas of competing state policy (environmental regulations, healthcare, etc) it is inefficient for states to compete for resources and business; the benefits of strong, national government policies outweigh any single innovative policy a state might offer
❖ Ross to Archie: Though America has changed, the human tendency toward fame, ambition, and self-interest has not truly changed
❖ Archie to Ross: There is no unique characteristic of federalism worth preserving in today’s society whose goals require national...