



# BOWDOIN STUDENT GOVERNMENT

**Meeting of the General Assembly**  
Wednesday, 10/16/2019, 8:30pm  
Daggett Lounge, Thorne

## *Agenda*

### *General Assembly Members*

**President** - Ural Mishra '20  
**Vice President of BSG Affairs** – Arein Nguyen '21  
**Chair of Student Affairs** – Ryan Britt '22  
**Chair of Academic Affairs** – Lily Tedford '22  
**Chair of Diversity and Inclusion** – Marcus Williams '21  
**Chair of Student Organizations** – Sonia Shah '22  
**Chair of the Treasury** – Charlotte Hall '20  
**Chair of Facilities and Sustainability** – Wilder Short '22

**Class of 2020 President** – Angel Ramirez '20  
**Class of 2021 President** – Brittney McKinley '21  
**Class of 2022 President** – Steven Xu '22  
**Class of 2023 President** – Aoguzi Muhameiti '23

**Multicultural Coalition Representative** – Journey Browne '22  
**McKeen Center Representative** – Lauren Caffé '22  
**Sexuality, Women and Relationships Representative** – Becky Berman '20  
**Athletics Representative** – Anne Maher '21

**Curriculum Implementation Committee Representative** – Joe Hilleary '20  
**Curriculum and Educational Policy Committee Representative** – Cat Booker '20  
**Faculty Committee Representative** – Caroline Poole '21  
**Counselling and Health Services Representative** – Safa Saleh '22  
**Residential Life Representative** – Khushi Patel '23  
**Sustainability Representative** – Tyler Diaz '22  
**Dining and Campus Services Representative** – Carlos Campos '22  
**Safety and Security Representative** – Nothando Khumalo '23

**Development Representative** – Ryan Kovarovics '23  
**Development Representative** – Christiana Okafor '23  
**Development Representative** – Lauren Leatham '23

**Director of Programming and Communications** – Maya Dowling-Wolfe '23  
**Secretary** – Alissa Chen '22

## Table of contents

1. Call to order (Page 3)
2. Public comment time (Page 3-6)
3. Matt Orlando's statement (Page 7-12)
4. Q&A with Matt Orlando and Mary Lou Kennedy about the housekeepers (Page 12-22)
5. Statement from Sherry (Page 23)
6. Conversations with the housekeepers that were present (Page 23-24)
7. Vote to delay voting on the proposal to support housekeepers to the following meeting (Page 25)
8. Concluding remarks/ideas (Page 26-27)

<b>I. Call to Order</b>	
Ural	<p>Thank you everyone for coming. This is the most number of people that have come here to BSG ever... or at least my first year since the 2016 election... We're going to do a brief explanation of how everything is going to be laid out. We're going to start with roll call and then we'll going to go to public comment time. Here students who are not in the assembly can chime in. I hope that won't take too much time because Mary Lou and Matt can't stay for too long. After that we are going to have a conversation with Matt and Mary Lou. I know Matt has a statement prepared. They are here to answer questions and clear up confusion or concerns you may have about the housekeepers. There's going to be a discussion between the assembly and our two guests. During public comment time, no assembly members may speak. When it's over, assembly members will be given preference to speak with the guests. If you have any questions that come up during that time, send it to the assembly members and hopefully they'll be able to ask it. I will say I understand that this is something people care about deeply, and I want people to be cognizant and respectful. Matt and Mary Lou are here in good faith, and I hope we remember that and can keep the discourse civil and productive. We've already have a lot of conversations about this topic last week, and seeing that we have gotten one side of it, I thought it would be useful to invite them in and provide the other side so the assembly can make as informed of a decision as possible. It's our job to take that information to do what we think is best for the assembly and the student body. While Matt makes his statement, please write down your questions that you have, and I hope we can have a thoughtful and engaging discussion. We're going to start with roll call.</p>
<b>II. Roll Call</b>	
Arein	*Roll Call*
<b>III. Public Comment Time</b>	
Ural	<p>We're going to start with public comment time. Are there any students who would like to raise any questions or points of concern before we go into Matt's statement? Please say your name before you say something so we can have it in the minutes.</p>
Song	<p>I'm here to make a statement for the Bowdoin Labor Alliance. We're here because we believe students</p>

	<p>have the responsibility to expose areas where the college should do better. As representatives of the student body, BSG members should echo and support student efforts to support on-campus staff. Not doing so is as much of a statement as doing so.</p>
Beth	<p>Thank you very much for hearing me today. We need to protect our right to free speech. It's concerning that people may want to speak out but aren't comfortable. Here at Bowdoin, there is a history of workers' concerns being silence. It used to be a common phrase for people to hear is that if you don't like it you can leave, a terrifying line to hear when struggling to put food on the table. We need to undo the damage that keeps people silent to this day. Workers at the college should have no reason to fear to vocalizing concerns and calling for changes that are needed. People at Bowdoin are here to make the world a better place, and why not start at home. We need students' support and have since gotten it since this issue first got noticed. Let's make our voices heard, please support this measurement so that we can show everyone that at this school, students have their backs.</p>
Justin	<p>I'm a member of the class of 2022. I don't have a prepared statement, but from the article that was released on the Orient a few weeks ago, it seems pretty clear that wage wasn't the only issue brought up. It seemed like the human dignity of the workers here and their health were being undermined by the working conditions here at the Bowdoin. When I saw the response from Mr. Orlando, who thankfully joined us here today, it frankly concerned me. It seems like they cared more about the outside image of the college instead of the actual concerns by the workers. For example, when there was a quote in there that one of the housekeepers was brave enough to bring up, that one of their supervisors said "you chose to be a housekeeper," and that's why you have these conditions. The fact that there isn't an internal investigation going on, and nothing was addressed in response to that article, I think, is pretty concerning to me. I was wondering if you can respond to that. As BSG, I hope you can represent us as students, and I hope you can take the appropriate action to do something about that</p>
Ben Ray	<p>I'm here to speak on behalf of the student section of the BLA. Our housekeepers are great friends. They're [the housekeepers] really courageous to be</p>

	<p>here tonight. I have a lot of admiration for them. This is a big issue. There's a lot of hearts to it, it's not just wages. It's not just what Bowdoin is as a place, it's bigger than that. A combination of all of that. I think it's important that we can talk to Matt Orlando, to whoever is the person behind all of this. There are statements coming out in response to all the people speaking out. I'm disappointed that people who spoke out didn't get the invite also. There's a tendency to hear both sides, when the side who spoke out in the first place hasn't gotten this attention. We've been doing this work for a year and a half now. And it took the people who have been affected to do the crazy thing of putting their name on an article to get this attention. And now we have a platform where we can talk about it, and I want to make sure that this can be a conversation between everyone. I know everyone just got back to campus, and it's even harder for students or any other members of the community to turn out here and make their voices heard. Seems like a good crowd and willing to talk about this. We can all do this together, I think. There is space in this movement for everyone so they can support people they know. But the BLA started because there are things happening on campus and voices from campus that were not being heard. I'm really proud that this is happening tonight, but I don't want the conversation to end here. There are a lot of ways to help like making comments during public comment time. The BSG is voting on something real tonight. I think it's a symbolic statement of getting support, but it's still really real for the people who need your support. Thank you for your time.</p>
Leif Maynard '23	<p>As a freshmen, I think it's really important for us coming in to acknowledge the power differences between all the parties here tonight. It was so courageous for the workers to put their name on the article in a publicized newspaper. There are consequences for that that could happen. As students, we have the power because the college relies on us to be here. We are the mission of the school. Our voices matter in a way that has more institutional power because of that. That power gets magnified in the BSG. You guys have a unique power, and even if it's symbolic statement that comes out tonight. You represent the voices of the Bowdoin community and student community and that has its own power. The</p>

	<p>members of the administration and the employees here tonight represent the college, that has its own power, and I think it's really important that the parties here understand that that power deserves respect and conversation, but it's also a two way street. Considering all these factors are important. And the courage of the workers to put their names out there needs to be acknowledged too.</p>
Anibal	<p>I'm a member of BLA. To echo what Leif said, this all began when a housekeeper came to us with an op-ed but was too afraid to release it because of retaliation. To remind people, the purpose of this legislation is to condemn something that already should be condemned. We are asking the college to increase its transparency, and that workers not face retaliation. I'm hoping this isn't a big ask. I don't think Mary Lou, Matt Orlando, BLA, or the students here believe that's impossible, or that intimidation should be happening on campus.</p>
Diego Grossman	<p>I want to echo everything that has been said. Some housekeepers that are dear friends of ours are here. It's really special. But the fact that some people are afraid to do that is crazy. Even if it's residual or from previous workplace culture, the fact that there were some people contributing to the op-ed and coming to our meetings for the last year and half who were simply too afraid to put their names on the op-ed. I don't think Bowdoin should be that kind of work environment. And if it's not, or if it won't ever be, Bowdoin shouldn't hesitate to make a public declaration that no intimidation, retaliation, termination will happen to anyone who speaks out, wants changes to work, has any concerns. We don't think it should be a hard ask for BSG to support workers for a living wage because workers are also people and need to live. Because the current compensation program, as we have shown in quotes and testimonies, it's been shown that it clearly doesn't work for people. People wouldn't put their jobs, which is like their lives, on the line to critique something that isn't working, because it's an issue. Please support this, it would mean a lot for the people who work and make this place look 2 billion dollars.</p>
Ural	<p>Thank you from everyone who spoke. Now we can go to Matt's statement</p>
<b>IV. Conversation with Matt Orlando and Mary Lou Kennedy</b>	

Matt

I don't know if it's a statement, more like a set of comments. Really glad to be here at the assembly. Thank you inviting me and Mary Lou tonight, and giving me an opportunity to answer questions you may have, to clarify some of what was in the minutes. And really to hear from you about your concerns about the housekeepers.

First, I don't think many of you know me. I've been in this role since July of 2016. My role is fairly broad I am responsible for the division of finance and administration. Under the finance category, I oversee the budget's office, treasury's office, controller's office, insurance, human resources, and compliance. On the administration side, I'm responsible for facilities to which housekeeping is a part of, dining services, campus stores, Children's Center, events and summer programs, safety and security. Mary Lou is with me tonight. You probably know her because she's attended the assembly before. She's currently the associate VP and executive director of campus services, dining, and college stores. She has led the Bowdoin dining services operation since 1989. There's a long line ahead of me that have said this, but she is one of the best managers the college has ever had here. Unfortunately for us, Mary Lou has let me know she'll be retiring in about a year. Given that things are winding down, I've asked her to help me assess the function of the housekeeping dept, the work environment, and make recommendations to improve the work environment, the communication between housekeepers and supervisors, and the communication among workers themselves. I'm very grateful for her and her work. As I understand it, the assembly is considering a statement about supporting housekeepers, I just want to say I fully support housekeepers, I can't overstate how much I appreciate the work they do, frankly all of the staff on campus. Not only do they provide us with the critical services, but, and you all know this, they have developed and will continue to develop meaningful relationship with students, faculty and staff, and they're a key ingredient to what makes the Bowdoin experience so special. They deserve exceptional compensation, and we pay a lot of attention to that constantly to make sure that's what they get. I did have a moment to read the minutes from last week. Putting the wage issue aside for a moment, the two

	<p>common threads I found were the widespread fear among housekeepers of retaliation for speaking up and that housekeepers are not provided with adequate training. I can say a lot about both but with respect to the voicing of grievances and fear of retaliation. The College, the administration, would never retaliate, would never intimidate, or even tolerate that. It's against our ethos, what we're all about and I have zero tolerance for that. I have no evidence of any one being retaliated against, treated harshly, intimidated or speaking up for attending a rally, wearing a yellow ribbon, for having their name attached to anything in the Orient. Zero evidence. If anyone has any evidence, I want to see it. I have zero tolerance for that happening, it doesn't happen here. The other thing I'll say, I've spent a lot of time with housekeeping for the past two years. I'm grateful for the things brought to light. I can't address things that occurred in the past, but I can make things better.. I've attended a lot of staff meetings, I've attended staff meetings without the supervisors so it's just me and the housekeepers. For those that are afraid to speak up, I invite them to my office. I've had many meetings with individual and groups of housekeepers. I try to go around campus to be in constant conversation with them. This is not a bashful group. They let me know, they're not holding back on things that need to be said. I just wanted to put that out here. We're happy to answer any questions, and I have some clarifying comments from the minutes from last week, I'm happy to tick through the questions from the BSG assembly last week.</p>
Ural	<p>Let's start with those. People can pull up the minutes form last week.</p>
Matt	<p>This is page 11. From Cat, about the lowest pay being 12.65 for the starting rate, and the lowest pay 13.35 as of Sep 2019. Has it been changed, we don't know.</p> <p>The minimum starting rate for this school year is 12.65, but 13.35 for anyone who was employed prior to July 1. Therefore, for a continuing employee, the lowest rate is 13.35. If we hire someone today, and there will be some housekeepers boarding on shortly, one today actually.... They will start at 12.65. The 51 housekeepers, that were on staff as of July 1, the lowest rate of pay is 13.35.</p>



	<p>Next page 12, In the op-ed the housekeepers wrote, it's disturbing to me that they would rather pay lawyers and legal fees to fight against the housekeepers for the living wage.</p> <p>There's no fight against the housekeepers, I'm fully supporting the housekeepers. There's no us and them.</p> <p>If that's the way the housekeepers feel, then that says something about the way they're being treated that in of it itself is intimidating. If I have to voice my concerns, I have to go up against high paying college lawyers as well, and not just my supervisor.</p> <p>I'm not encouraging lawyers to fight the housekeepers.</p> <p>Have there been any legal battles between the college and housekeeping?</p> <p>There are no legal battles going on.</p> <p>I thought it was really great on the comment about the student responsibilities for cleanups. Recognizing that it falls on housekeepers often, especially on weekends. I know, it's a big ask, I really appreciate the assembly's recognition of that and including some of that. If it was mitigated somehow, that would be great.</p> <p>There was a lot about the spill team., It was implied that we bring in some outside spill team whenever there is vomit or urine or anything. It's the housekeepers. There is no spill team. We have different shifts, first shift second shift, third shirt. It's usually the weekend workers and late shift or early in the morning, and it tends to be the same people. They're highly trained and deal with it quite a bit. But it's not a spill team, they're housekeepers.</p>
Mary Lou	<p>If it was a biohazard, they explained to us today in a training session that they would bring in an outside company to clean it up</p>
Matt	<p>I just want to clarify on shifts. Most housekeepers' shifts are 5am to 1:30pm. College hours start at 7am. The first two hours, the housekeepers are being paid a third shift premium. Housekeepers get a 15%</p>

increase on their hourly rate. If a housekeeper was paid \$14, for the first two hours of the day they get 16.10. They get a 10% premium increase for the second shift that starts goes from the afternoon to 11pm where that 10% premium implies.

Bodily fluid incident during the day, is it still on the housekeepers?

It absolutely is still on the housekeepers, regardless of what time it happens.

Pg. 17, I do agree with the students' responsibility to clean up after themselves, but as far as the \_\_\_\_\_ goes, that's not something that's left up to the students. Is there any way that proper training for the house keepers can be included. When you become a housekeeper, I don't think you're supposed to know how to do it, dangerous chemicals like carcinogens.

First, if there are dangerous chemicals, like any carcinogens, we do not ask them to clean it up. If it's oil or fuel, we bring in motorpool staff that are specially trained to clean that up. If we have a chemical incident we have the environmental health and safety team. There is a very structured organized training day on bloodborne pathaging, vomit, feces, how to clean up, how to recognize chemical leaks, that sort of thing. That is something they learn when they are hired. And there is annual training on that too

Matt Orlando did mention that there was training for the housekeepers, but I don't expect that there's much training.

As I said, there is extensive training. We can send out the outline of the training we have on those annual sessions.

In Matt Orlando's article. There are different methods for housekeepers to come make their comments. Do you know of the ways they can do that? He didn't list them

	<p>Sure I can list them here now. Ideally if there is a grievance or a complaint, it's first attempted to be worked out between the supervisor and worker, or the worker and the senior officer, which is me in this case. However we have other avenues if that doesn't work. There is a workplace advisors program, these are volunteers across campus of faculty, staff, administrators who are trained and have an interest in providing counseling. If a worker has something they're struggling with, if it's a boss, a work-life issue etc., we also have a hotline, through our health plan provider Anthem, we have program where it's totally confidential. If you are having a work-related issue, how to invest your 401A, of whether to lease or buy a car. If you have a work place issue, there will be referrals. You can get 8 free visits to a licensed counselor, who is experienced in helping someone work through workplace issues. Lastly, there is a formal grievance policy, it's in the staff handbook. It outlines what any employee can do. The three step process is to initially bring the grievances forward to the dept head and HR. If it can't be resolved in those conversations, then it will be delegated to the senior officer. If that doesn't work, then it goes to Clayton, the president, who can convene a committee to look into that matter. If the supervisor, dept head, senior officer, are part of that complaint, then it can go straight to Clayton. If Clayton is the part of the complaint, then we have an anonymous whistle blower hotline. There is a link on our code of conduct page, you can file your concern and it goes to the audit chair of the board on the Board of Trustees. There are various channels that are out there.</p> <p>If we go to pg. 19 at the bottom, where it says people are telling us about how Mary Lou is getting people to take pictures of other housekeepers doing things wrong. People are being split apart: it's a divide and conquer method. That's how they find justifications to push people out.</p> <p>Mary Lou has not asked anyone to take pictures and spy on each other.</p>
Mary Lou	I will speak for that. I have not asked for a picture, I have not seen any picture. I have seen two grandchildren pictures and a dog picture. I did not ask for or have seen any picture that people have

	taken at work or anything else. Where that came from, I do not know.
Matt	<p>And then it goes on to say, about these justifications for “pushing people out”. We have not terminated anyone in the last three years. We’ve had a couple, where they began their 6 month adaptation period. Within the 6 month adaptation period, whenever we hire someone, they have these 6 months to see how they perform and separate if it doesn’t work out.</p> <p>There has been no retaliation in any way shape or form where we “push people out”.</p> <p>These things are normalized now, which is about the spectrum of retaliation and fear. There has been some one on one meetings, I haven’t heard that everyone has had one.</p> <p>Part of what Mary Lou did, which was smart. She didn’t know a lot of housekeepers so she set up 30 min session with all 49 attending housekeepers. The two that weren’t there were on leave. She’s learned a quite bit from these and shared the results from the session this morning and was totally transparent about it.</p>
Ural	Ok cool thank you, let’s go into questions from the assembly.
Caroline	I want to thank you both for coming out today. There are a lot of questions, so thank you for taking the time. First, the Bowdoin fact website you shared in the Orient article, the average pay for Bowdoin housekeepers is 15.11, but the lowest wage is 13.35. What does it mean by average hourly wage, what percent is paid with this 13.35?
Matt	So for what is the average, the active housekeepers, as of Sep 1, not the team leaders or supervisors, just the housekeeper 1’s, 2’s, and seniors all 51, what that average is. It excludes the differentials that they received, weekend premiums, anything like that, the average is just their base hourly rate. Second part was...
Caroline	What percent is paid with this 13.35.
Matt	I don’t know the percentage, but we have roughly 750 hourly staff and administrators, employees. 38 make between \$13-14 and 38 between 14 - \$15. So 76
Carlos	Is the information you listed accessible by any other sources? Is it available online?

Matt	Yes on the human resources website, benefits page, and the staff handbook
Steven	Hello Matt, and thank you for coming by today. I know we hear a lot about you on the Orient and other sources. It's good to put a name to a face. What future steps has the college planned on to improve the working conditions for the housekeepers. Anything that the college is working on?
Matt	This is something we have been paying attention to, not something that we focused on because of the op-ed. There have been a number of changes in housekeeping over the last 18 months, dealing with safety training, better protocols. These are strenuous jobs, with a lottasks that risk repetitive motion injuries. We've bought lightweight microfiber mops, highspeed electric scrubbers for them to use instead of manually scrubbing the floors. They are, still using the green cleaning products. Not everyone loves that, they don't clean quite as well. Haven't figure that out yet. The training has been more robust. Staff meetings have been more frequent, especially with Mary Lou's arrival. There wasn't a routine before, and there hasn't been a forum to come together on a team basis with management. Mary Lou has been mentoring supervisors and team leaders_____. Looking forward, we are still gathering information for Mary Lou, since we just started asking for her to do this in August. So still assessing things, and she's taking a look at everything. Like housekeeper roles 1, 2, and seniors, the overall structure. Are two team leaders enough? We have 52 housekeepers spread across campus. It is really hard to supervise all of them. Communication amongst coworkers and supervisors. That's on the management side. On the wages side, we did a midyear adjustment so that differentials increased. That was in September 18, and January in 2019, we announced the wage adjustments that Caroline mentioned that became effective on July 1. It was all designed so that our employee compensation package is at the top of the market.
Marcus	Thank you for coming in today. Especially with the idea around branding. I just want to get a sense of if you kept track of the retention rate in comparison to dining. How many people have quit in your time here?
Matt	The turnover rate has been remarkably low, well below any sort of industry average, we typically

	benchmark against those. I don't have the three year data, but I know that in the past year, we've had 2 retirements and 1 promotion. This person was promoted to a different area of the college. But no one has left for a better opportunity..
Marcus	To follow that up, I was just curious given that conversation before. _____. How do we determine housekeeper's wages and what goes into the calculations.
Matt	As I have mentioned, we want to provide our staff with exceptional wages and benefits, we think about that comprehensively and we want to be sure we are at the top of the market every year. So we do use benchmarks to assess the market every year. We get the information from multiple surveys, and we match the various job descriptions like a chef over in dining to the description of chefs in the surveys. But we find the best match for the comparable job, and we select the high range from the surveys. For example, you are a chef 1 you might make between 20 and 24 dollars. If you are an exceptional employee, you will get the high end of that range. If you are low performer, a needs improvement type of employee, we don't have a lot but every employer has some, they get the low end of the range. That's how we sort of work our way through that. Living wage is a hard one, it's very hard to hang your hat on living wages because it's based on the family combinations and where you live. We believe in equal pay for equal work, where you don't get paid a different amount for the same job depending on where you live and how many people in your household
Aoguzi	On the idea of living wage, it is available. The Maine dept of labor does publish a report every decade or so. There is a standard that Bowdoin could look to. Currently a single adult and child, it's 19.81. This report was in 2010, it could increase by now. There is a way to calculate wage. Second, one of the solutions we thought for housekeepers is for the housekeeping to unionize. I understand Brunswick High School custodians are unionized. But with that comes with certain consequences, certain scares. I want to hear you on record if there will be any retaliation against housekeepers if they unionize.
Matt	I just want to say it's the law. I don't want to go to jail. The National Labor relations board is very much in support of the employees. You can't retaliate.
Aoguzi	So you'd be perfectly fine with them unionizing

Matt	I would not retaliate
Aoguzi	But you suggested...
Matt	I'm not going to give comment on that.
Caroline	In the Orient piece published on Feb 15 this year. The starting hourly wages over at Hyde and Brunswick High are 17.42 and 20.75 respectively. Could you explain why these are higher than the starting wage for Bowdoin housekeepers at 12.65.
Matt	Great question. If you look at the job descriptions for Hyde and Brunswick High, it is definitely true that custodians perform cleaning tasks, which overlap with what our housekeepers do. But when you're at a public school, it's one building, and a custodian has ownership of that entire building. At Bowdoin, we have a huge campus, we can't have just housekeepers, jack of all trades who can do electric work, maintaining the furnace, plowing, shoveling the front door. We are specialized here. We have an electric shop, we have a grounds crew, a carpentry shop. If you look at the job description, they have a larger portfolio of skills. For example, carpentry, fixing leaking faucets, minor repairs of doors. It's a different job from what we ask housekeepers to do.
Carlos	To Matt Orlando, you have stated multiple times that the college would not retaliate. Today you have stated, "The college would not retaliate, would never intimidate. Would not tolerate that. It goes against the ethos of the college." You along with President Rose said you support housekeepers. Does that mean you support a formal administrative announcement declaring this and that you support the BSG proposal put forth by Caroline.
Matt	Thanks. Like I said, I speak for the administration. I don't know what else I need to do to put myself out there
Ryan K	In the op-ed, there are housekeepers who have been employed for numerous years and less than dollar more than their counterparts that were hired 6 months ago. Can you speak a little bit about the wage structure that allows housekeepers to make a career out of their housekeeping as way to further their quality of life.
Matt	Great question. On your last point, about keeping up with the cost of living. For as long as I've been here.... Well, first we are a pay for performance, merit system. We have a pool that we set aside, this

	<p>year its 3%. For the last 10 years, CPI, I'm using the national consumer price index, is just under 2%, 1.8, 1.9. Our staff raises have been 3% every year. You can't find this online but I can tell you that most of our NESCAC peers, for administrative staff, 2 to 2.5% increases. For the last 10 years, you'd be hard pressed to find any school does more than Bowdoin in terms of cost of living adjustments. Just to speak to that specific thing.</p> <p>With respect to career and development opportunities, there are housekeepers 1, 2, and seniors with different levels of responsibility and different pay ranges. To be a housekeeper 2, a lot of it has to do with independently providing guidance to a housekeeper 1 and help train them. Senior housekeepers are given even more responsibility. Team leaders can't be everywhere, so we rely on the senior housekeepers to make sure the supply closet is stocked, to provide training to the housekeepers on different tasks. And there's broader array of cleaning tasks they can do. They might sweep a buffer or strip and wax floors. There's a skill set and expectation that they're learning those skills. There's a tier, very similar in dining with structure 1, 2, 3 but we're sensitive to the compression between the two.</p> <p>I don't want to get into the specifics of what was said by that individual, I want to protect confidentiality. Sometimes it may be the difference between performance levels. If you have a high performing housekeeper 2, just killing it here and getting the highest raises. They may well push up close to a low performing senior.</p>
Ryan K	Is it encouraged to be in that advancement?
Matt	Yes, it's encouraged. But I've heard from housekeepers that the ladder is not working well. I've heard that housekeepers would like clarity on this. We just haven't had a chance to make a change yet
Caroline	I do want to quickly address this merit system and the housekeepers 1, 2, 3, and team leaders you just mentioned. What's your system for adjusting the wages for these roles and/or for time spent at Bowdoin, and what are the average hourly wages for each of these positions?
Matt	I'd have to get you the averages for each category. Actually, I have seen this recently. I'm going to estimate. I believe, 1.50 is the average spread between the three categories.



Ryan B	Hi, I'm Ryan, thank you for coming today. When you're talking about high performing workers. How do you go about going determining high performing workers and low performing workers? And do you think someone that is designated as a low performing worker can become discouraged by that label?"
Matt	We hope that our managers are....., they address performance issues the right way, and are constructive in criticism. I'm a big believer in second chances. I have seen people who have been in the "needs improvement" category and worked their way through it. And sometimes that hasn't been the case. In different departments, I'm not talking about housekeeping specifically
Steven	Will the College conduct an investigation about what the supervisors said, about housekeepers speaking up, will the college conduct a formal investigation and publicly release the results.
Matt	I can't go back to what happened 5 years ago. Something that may have been said... There has been nothing brought forward to me that proves there has been any retaliatory actions ... and I don't know who wrote that.
Steven	We don't know either. Can we conduct an investigation
Matt	We will look into it
Steven	You're going to investigate into an investigation? Can we have a timeline
Matt	If whoever wrote that passage, I invite them to talk to me...
Steven	Can we have a timeline for when you can get back to us about the investigation
Matt	I will get back to you soon
Steven	Do you have a timeline for that
Matt	I don't have a timeline
Steven	We'll follow up
Ural	You can let me know
Matt	Yeah sure
Safa	The housekeepers discussed how they have to clean off-campus properties, they're walking long distances carrying their own equipment, or they have to use their own cars and don't get reimbursed for gas. Additionally, they talk about having to clean Clayton Rose's house, or houses. Do you have any comments about those statements?
Matt	I wrote a point about that in my op-ed. Just repeating what I said, which is the latter point that Clayton has

	<p>one house on campus, not two. Cleveland House is for guests to stay and for meetings. Also, if you look at any college or university, in almost all cases, the president is required to live on campus, as a part of the job description, and those facilities are cleaned by housekeeping by the university. There's nothing unusual about that whatsoever.</p> <p>The issue of traveling across campus, I think what was left out of the op-ed was that this occurs specifically during the overtime period, where it's 10 day mandatory overtime for other facility staff, between commencement and reunion each year. On a normal working day, like today, the equipment is already in all the buildings, so you don't have to lug anything across campus. Sure, they may have personal things they carry with them or maybe a favorite cleaning device that they may bring to different areas.</p> <p>There's an exception during this overtime period. They're not going to their usual buildings. For example, we may have 4 housekeepers to clean Howell House. There's only 1 vacuum kept in Howell house, so we have to bring 3 over. This is in May. We've purchased a number of pull carts to help with that. We try not to assign housekeepers so that someone is walking from Brunswick Apartments to Stowe Inn with their pull carts. Many housekeepers choose to drive because they prefer not to walk. I will say, despite our best intentions, where we try to co-locate, things happen. Somebody finished their job early, there's an emergency, there's a spill, they get called off, someone went home sick. Its a total team effort, and it's amazing what they do in 10 days. So, I can't say it never happens, I'm sure someone has had an incident where they have been assigned to Pine Street and then they have to go all the way over to Mayflower. But I haven't heard that as an issue that may come up.</p>
Lily	You mentioned earlier that benefits figure into an employees wage. What is the benefits package offered to housekeepers?
Ural	Can you speak up?
Lily	Sorry. You mentioned earlier that benefits figure into an employees wage. What is the benefits package offered to housekeepers?
Matt	Again, exceptional benefits here at Bowdoin. Two sort of lynchpins are the health plan and the retirement plan. Any who is age 26 can participate in

	the retirement plan. Unlike many employers (you're going to learn about this quickly when you all get your first jobs), they're going to require you to match, so they put in, say, 5% and you put in 3% of your own money. The College requires no match. 10% of your pay goes into a 401A where they have investment options. And then there are thresholds, that when met that 10% contribution goes to of a 12% contribution. On the health plan we have with 3 plans that we offer. I'm happy to say that 90% of the housekeepers enroll in one of the health plans. This doesn't happen at other places. I take a lot of pride in that the efforts we make so that our employee contribution toward the premium is not excessive for our staff. The College covers much of the cost, depending on the plan, 75-85% of the premium is paid by the college.
Aoguzi	Could Bowdoin afford to raise the minimum to \$15 avoid without any budget cuts.
Matt	I'm just wondering where the \$15 came from?
Aoguzi	It's the campaign for BLA.
Matt	What's the basis for that
Aoguzi	It gets us closer to the living wage because Maine Dept of Labor states it's \$19/hour.
Matt	For which county
Aoguzi	For Cumberland county, which is this county.
Matt	Only 1/3 of our housekeepers live in Cumberland county
Aoguzi	I can list off the living wage for other counties if you give me the names of them
Matt	Haha no that's ok. I guess haven't heard the \$15 scenario.
Aoguzi	Just so you know, they have every county. Back to my question, could Bowdoin afford raising the wage to \$15?
Matt	Not without making choices
Aoguzi	So there would be budget cuts
Matt	We would have to find the money
Aoguzi	So currently Bowdoin does not have the money to increase the hourly rate?
Matt	Every dollar in the budget this year is already allocated
Aoguzi	Ok. My second question, were there any changes in the supervisors recently?
Matt	We did have a resignation of the director of housekeeping this summer

Ural	What would the total cost of raising the minimum wage from starting wage to \$15 would be.
Matt	I don't have the specific calculations. But it would be more than what has been put out there. Some would be internal methods come from various places, when you move to a new minimum, whether it be 14, 15, 16. I mentioned that there are currently 78 hourly workers that make between \$13 and \$15. You can't calculate the cost solely to move to \$15 based on 78 people. Otherwise you create wage compression. A lot of folks would be upset if they're making \$15.05 and do not receive an adjustment. So it's a mistake to just look at it in isolation. And you have to tack on the benefit costs as well.
Arein	Regarding the complaints in the housekeeping op-ed. Do you know how many of the incidents occurred during the past 3 years?
Matt	I know there's some, but I didn't go through and count.
Caroline	The first question I have is from a member of the audience. They wanted to know why the housekeeping director resigned?
Matt	I can't comment on a personnel issue, sorry
Caroline	Ok. I also wanted to ask, I've spoken to a number of housekeepers on campus who say there's not enough people to clean all the buildings on campus. So I'm wondering do you believe the higher wage would help alleviate with the understaffing problems
Matt	I don't know how that would alleviate the understaffing problem. I do recognize that we've added some square footage, we've added park row, so there is additional space to clean. We're building Harpswell apts. And there will be Mills Halls in January 2022. We'll be taking down Coe at some point. But on balance, we do need more housekeepers when adding square footage. What we're taking a look at now is whether we need to clean as frequently on campus. Can we take the pressure off of the housekeepers who have to do these tasks repeatedly. I work in a old woodframe house on Federal Street . I don't need it cleaned everyday. There could be more of that going on. Because the reality is, the state of Maine is getting older, the labor pools are shrinking. It's unlikely the future here will have a good supply of labor to do things at the level we are currently operating at. It's absolutely on my mind.

Caroline	One more question, I want to go back to the comment in the op-ed about housekeepers being expected to take up extra jobs between commencement and graduation and any other larger events. Are the hourly wages adjusted when they're asked to assist with the event set up crews. Are these roles a part of their job description, or are they attached to a different payroll.
Matt	So moving equipment and furniture is a part of the job description for housekeepers 1, 2, and seniors. However, big change. Two years ago, we organized the events and set up teams, they had been outsourced in the past and the housekeepers were routinely asked to help with set ups and moving heavy furniture like armoires. I brought that team in house now, put a new manager in charge of it, who's done a phenomenal job, I don't have specific numbers, but I know the work order requests for housekeeping to assist with set ups or heavy moving of furniture has dropped dramatically. There may be small set ups like this where the housekeepers can assist with the set up chairs. However, the number of time that happens..... doesn't happen nearly as much.
Khushi	Thank you for coming. And has there been a conversation between housekeepers and supervisors about the op-ed, and if so, what does that conversation look like.
Matt	Mary Lou and I actually met with them the Monday after the op-ed. Not going to go into the details of that conversation, that's a staff meeting. It was a great conversation, we learned a lot, they learned a lot. Things to think about, and always trying to make it better.
Caroline	According to the MIT Living Wage calculator, in Cumberland County, the living wage for one adult with no children is 13.13. Why is Bowdoin's starting wage 12.65 below this
Matt	We set our wages on the competitive market, not on a living wage.
Caroline	I want to go back onto the comment you previously made that was related to counties. When comparing different wages, do you root them to counties that the housekeepers are from
Matt	Not at all. It's based on the wages paid by employers
Lauren C	I was curious about the setting of the individual meetings, I know it's a 1:1 situation. We discussed about as a person being in a 1:1 room with a supervisor, how that can be intimidating in and of

	<p>itself. I'm just curious to ask how those went. How did the housekeepers seem to be in a 1:1. Would you consider talking with a group of housekeepers?</p>
Mary Lou	<p>Like Matt said, the housekeepers were together. We had a big meeting this morning as well. When I met everyone 1:1, it was quite informal in my office. Just a series of questions, a get to know you session. How long have you been here, what attracted you to Bowdoin, what do you like about being here. It was the same questions for every person. Do you feel respected on campus, and do you feel recognized for doing a good job, and by whom? The last question gave the most feedback, if you change something, and what you would like to change? You have to take into account it was the first meeting, and some people were very comfortable. There were a few that weren't as comfortable. There were a few that weren't comfortable but then came back later. All that information was transparently shared today with the housekeepers. As much for the housekeepers to get to know each other, and it's a starting point for things that came up for seemed to be similar regarding changes. So that at least day that you're at work, so that each day you're comfortable. That's what I'm working on.</p>
Ural	<p>I know that we've already gone over the time limit, but if it's ok we can ask one last question</p>
Nothando	<p>So again, thank you for being here. Since you've been a member of the Bowdoin community for such a long time, I wanted to know if you've noticed any significant changes in housekeepers' attitudes regarding wages and also if there are _____.</p>
Mary Lou	<p>I was so focused on dining and other areas. That's one of the reasons I met with everybody, because I only knew the housekeepers I saw at Thorne Hall, maybe at Moulton or Smith I would run into, when I working over at Farley Field House and doing big the Lobster Bake, that type of thing. I didn't know a lot about what was going on in the residence house. It was as much of a learning opportunity for me to know what housekeepers do.</p>
Ural	<p>Thank you for coming. You didn't have to accept our invitation. We've gotten a lot of information on this situation.</p>
Diego	<p>Excuse me. I'm sorry. There are three housekeepers in this room, and there hasn't been any one asking three housekeepers in the rooms something. Cherie has something to say. Sandy would love to answer</p>

	your questions as well if you would give them the time as well.
Mary Lou	Were all the housekeepers invited? Did the others even know about it?
Diego	Does the BSG want to listen to people speak their voice too? Or do you not want to listen to them?
Mary Lou	I was just wondering if there was an invitation for all housekeepers to attend.
Ural	I think Diego invited some of the housekeepers to come with...
Diego	That's just how... Sherry has some things to say.
Ural	Yeah, no I'm...
Mary Lou	I was just curious
Diego	It would be great at an open forum if anyone can speak
Mary Lou	Did you not invite them?
Ural	I would happy to have them share their thoughts
Diego	Thank you
Sherry	I just got here about 15 min ago and didn't get everything that is going on, but I just about know what is going on. This is what I wanted to say. It doesn't take a diploma to get a hard worker to deserve better pay. Just because we don't have a diploma doesn't mean they have the right to underpay us. If they want to feel good about giving money for the common good, they should start with paying us for what we deserve.
Everyone	*snaps*
Sherry	Thank you You're a high class college known around the world for supporting your community, you definitely could choose to support us better than looking at the statistics and be the first to step up to take charge and leading the way to better pay. That's all I have. Thank you
Ural	Are there any questions.
Ryan K	Thank you for coming tonight. And also open up the floor for any specific responses that you are willing to share. Maybe the changes you've seen from Matt and Mary Lou, which have worked or not. Anything you can speak to about that?
Sherry	They're doing some good changes. Finally. We have some people on the floor who might have our backs. I think it would prove a lot more for more pay in our paycheck. We've been struggling here for people to listen to us, and we have people definitely listening to

	<p>us. Outside of here, we are struggling with our pay. I have to work two jobs in order to make ends meet. Most of us do. Just because I don't have a college degree doesn't mean I should have to work 2 jobs to make ends meet. I think Matt is a great guy who's trying his best but has his hands tied. He's trying to untie his hands but I think he could do a lot better. Mary Lou you're doing great job too. I know you're just starting to help us, and you don't know all of us, but you're learning, and I think you're going in a good direction with helping us.</p>
Ryan K	<p>Going back to that promotional structure. Do you feel that the tiers of housekeepers is something that is good or useful in career building?</p>
Sherry	<p>It started a long time ago, the tiers. It hasn't been implemented in a long time. And Matt is finally here. He's getting started on it, but his hands are tied in a lot of ways we don't know a lot about. If we keep pushing him to push whoever, I think we'll get there. It's a process and I hope it'll work out in the end. I haven't seen good for the step ladder yet. But I guess it's a work in progress</p>
Caroline	<p>We've heard from Matt about the official avenues for airing grievances, but I would love to hear from the housekeepers side, what those avenues look like, are they open, are they clear, are they accessible. IF there's a complaint you wish voice, are there are specific ways to so, and are they clear to you.</p>
Sherry	<p>They're getting there. There's been a long time when we said something and they're like it's the way it is. There's nothing we can do about it. Nobody wants to take the time and responsibility to make a decision for us.</p>
Ural	<p>Are there any other questions or comments? Thank you for standing up and speaking out. Thank you for coming, we really appreciate it.</p>
Arein	<p>Thank you for coming out tonight. I think that based on what Diego has brought up, we should open up the conversation to join us for the following week. Because we're running out of time for two votes tonight, I would personally like to motion to move our votes for next week's meeting with the housekeeping staff. Because we only have 11 more min to vote, because I would like to see the other side of the topic as much as we could. Yes I motion to vote for that.</p>
Ben	<p>Also, instead of inviting people at night. Sorry, I know you're doing something right now. We have to</p>



	get up a 5, 4, 3:30. If you want to be accessible, we can talk about this right when work ends. Coming in the evening would be challenging.
Marcus	
Ural	Yeah, motion to invite who can make it next week and have more of a discussion. We envision this as questions and responses coming in and then the assembly having a discussion with the public and then voting. But we don't have a whole lot of time to do that. If you would like to vote tonight, you can vote against this motion. If you'd like to vote next week, motion for it. We will extend the invitation regardless. How does that sound? Just to clarify the BSG president only votes in the event of a tie. You can vote for or against or abstain. The required majority is 15.
Cat	Just to clarify, if we vote against the motion, we are having the vote tonight.
Ural	That is correct.
Cat	Nay
Becky	Nay
Ryan B	Yay
Lauren	Nay
Carlos	Yay
Tyler	Yay
Charlotte	Yay
Joe	Yay
Nothando	Nay
Ryan K	Yay
Anne	Nay
Brittney	Nay
Aoguzi	Nay
Arein	Yay
Christiana	Yay
Khushi	Nay
Caroline	Nay
Angel	Yay
Safa	Nay
Sonia	Yay
Wilder	Yay
Lily	Yay
Marcus	Yay
Steven	What's the tally so far?
Ural	Also we miscounted because we included non-voting members of the assembly. 13 is the required majority. 10 Nays and 12 Yays.
Steven	Nay

Arein	So 11:12
Steven	It's 12:12
Ural	No, it's actually 13:11. So this motion passes. We will be voting for this proposal next week.
Nate Demoranville	*Boo*
Marcus	You asked for this!
Ural	I understand the urgency... But I do think it is important to give this a little more discussion, there are things we can still add to this proposal if we'd like. There's still time for amendments especially given the new information we have. If there are more requests, it's perfectly acceptable. Arein and I will make a formal invitation to all housekeeping staff who are willing and able to come next week
Angel	When the events are sent out, like the BSG meetings, are they sent out to the students and not the general staff.
Ural	They're primarily for students, but on the list servers, there are a number of administrators. I'm not sure which ones, but some of them do have access though.
Angel	What is the feasibility for the events to be sent out to staff members, professors maybe?
Ural	We don't have access to that distribution list, which has been an issue in the past. If you'd like to share the minutes with other individuals. I have no objection to that
Ryan K	Is there going to be an attempt made to have a meeting with housekeepers earlier in the day where a select few members of the BSG can make it, where we can listen to housekeepers concerns and better cater to their schedule. There are many of us with no classes after 1:30, when the first shift gets off of work. Could there be an attempt to make a meeting happen? The results of that meeting could be reported to the assembly as a whole.
Ural	Absolutely. Who's interested in Ryan's idea... We'll figure out the logistics afterwards. People can come up to the front afterwards and we can figure it out. Is there anything else people would like to say before we conclude this meeting.
Ryan K	Did the motion that was passed include postponing the procedural things with the minutes?
Ural	Yeah, we don't have time to do that
Steven	In the email with the minutes, can you include the report form the ad hoc wifi committee
Ural	Yes. I would encourage you guys to speak to as many of the members of the student body about what was discussed today. It's important to adequately

	<p>represent peers, that's what we're here for. And then we can come back next week to discuss this further. People who are interested in talking to the housekeepers can come in that day or at any point over the next week, please do that. And we can get that information after the assembly.</p>
<b>V. Adjournment</b>	
Ural	<p>Do I see a motion to adjourn?  With no objections  *adjourns*</p>